| **Student Name:** Ishan Harishankar |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house believes that rehabilitation should be the only consideration in criminal sentencing. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  [NOTE: Today’s speeches are 5 minutes’ long.]  Our opening is delivered clearly, but largely just a repeat of the motion. We may want to highlight how rehabilitation is the only path forward because any other path subjects and imposes a life of violence onto offenders. We spent a fair chunk of time just explaining how prison is bad, without doing this under the framework of an argument or any focus on strategy.  Set-up   * We need to establish the kinds of prisons we would support; for instance, where they are still part of society, where we focus on upskilling and vocational training etc. We try to add detail, but do it in vague terms rather than being specific through the use of context or examples.   + Crime often stems from complex social and psychological factors such as poverty, addiction, lack of education, and trauma. Rehabilitation can address these issues directly, offering therapy, job training, educational opportunities, and substance abuse treatment. * Why is the alternative punishment? Why can’t rehab be one of many considerations instead? We’re shadow-boxing Opp here - this isn’t a strategic use of time!   POI: This is a wash; there are no guarantees on either side of the house!  Argument 1   * We need to establish, beyond that rehabilitation works, that the primary goal of the justice system should be to reduce crime and improve society. Then, explain how rehabilitation offers the best chance of achieving this by addressing the root causes of criminal behavior and equipping individuals with the skills and support they need to become productive members of society. * Punishment, while offering a sense of retribution, does little to address the underlying issues that lead to crime. * Is it that people commit crime because they don’t know this is forbidden, or what? We hint at this when we talk about exposure to education, but we need to analyse why crime happens and how we fix this more comprehensively. * We should link this to the long-run impact; explain how the cycle of crime gets broken here; we hint at recidivism, but need to break down where it happens and why to be able to claim that we fix it.   05:34 - we are speaking over time!  We need to ask POIs consistently! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Lilianna Poon |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house believes that rehabilitation should be the only consideration in criminal sentencing. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  [NOTE: Today’s speeches are 5 minutes’ long.]  Why isn’t it guaranteed to work? Why is it the case that this instance matters so much, as opposed to being a wash. Instead, lead with the more comprehensive concerns angle you reference but then move on from.  Set-up   * What does your side support? What considerations do judges evaluate when sentencing - what examples highlight how sentencing is entirely context dependent; for instance, that some are beyond rehab, but others are not. We’re vague in claiming that rehab doesn’t work for some people; this POI from Luke applies here too; if they hate it so much - why would they change their behaviour? Should we take this risk and release them back into society?   + Other factors, such as retribution, deterrence, and public safety, must also play a role in sentencing. Ignoring these factors undermines the legitimacy of the legal system and risks jeopardizing public safety.   Rebuttal   * In what sense may they be too violent to change? This is important, and we need to break this down in greater detail! For instance, ​​for some, violence has become a deeply ingrained pattern of behavior, learned through repeated exposure and reinforcement. Unlearning these patterns can be incredibly difficult, especially if the individual's environment continues to reinforce violent behavior.   Argument 1   * How is this distinct from the analysis you’re presenting in the rebuttal? Is this following the full structure of an argument?   Argument 2   * Why is punishment the correct moral system/why would it achieve what your side claims it will?   + Maybe it is because victims and society deserve to see that those who commit crimes are held accountable for their actions.   + Victims and society deserve to see that those who commit crimes are held accountable for their actions.   05:07  We need to ask POIs consistently! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Jennie Jung |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house believes that rehabilitation should be the only consideration in criminal sentencing. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  [NOTE: Today’s speeches are 5 minutes’ long.]  Why is knowledge of this/awareness the pre-requisite? Is it the absence of these traits that leads to crimes being committed?  We claim they say rehab doesn’t work, but that we claim it does. Is this a rebuttal? Or is this a summary of the exchange so far? What is the strategic value of this observation?  Did we engage in rebuttal? Is there such a thing as someone too violent for rehabilitation? Does it always work?  We need to establish the kinds of prisons we would support; for instance, where they are still part of society, where we focus on upskilling and vocational training etc. We try to add detail, but do it in vague terms rather than being specific through the use of context or examples.  Argument 1   * What is the thesis or key central claim of this argument? * Don’t take two POIs in a row; you haven’t even answered one before you take another. This leads to more confusion than clarity. * Why does rehabilitation work? You need to explain how someone changes their mind and stops committing crime. * Crime often stems from complex social and psychological factors such as poverty, addiction, lack of education, and trauma. Rehabilitation can address these issues directly, offering therapy, job training, educational opportunities, and substance abuse treatment. We need to analyse why crime happens and how we fix this more comprehensively. * We need to establish, beyond that rehabilitation works, that the primary goal of the justice system should be to reduce crime and improve society. Then, explain how rehabilitation offers the best chance of achieving this by addressing the root causes of criminal behavior and equipping individuals with the skills and support they need to become productive members of society.   As second, we need to spend more time on rebuttal. We barely spent a full minute on rebuttal today!  We need to ask POIs consistently!  05:13 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Boris Cheung |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house believes that rehabilitation should be the only consideration in criminal sentencing. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  [NOTE: Today’s speeches are 5 minutes’ long.]  Make the opening less about abuse, and more about - there are a number of considerations and these decisions must be made contextually, rather than sweepingly as Prop does.  Rebuttal   * Good work summarising each of the points you’ll respond to here. * On the type of prisons - explain you don't have to defend horrific prison conditions or systems; rehabilitation is sufficiently bad if they lack the same amount of resources on their side. * POI - explain why this is valuable, but just not the most important outcome in the world; establish how other factors, such as retribution, deterrence, and public safety, must also play a role in sentencing. Ignoring these factors undermines the legitimacy of the legal system and risks jeopardizing public safety.   Argument 1   * Is this a new argument? Extrapolate as to why some people need deterrence in this form specifically. * What does your side support? What considerations do judges evaluate when sentencing - what examples highlight how sentencing is entirely context dependent; for instance, that some are beyond rehab, but others are not. We’re vague in claiming that rehab doesn’t work for some people. * In what sense may they be too violent to change? This is important, and we need to break this down in greater detail! For instance, ​​for some, violence has become a deeply ingrained pattern of behavior, learned through repeated exposure and reinforcement. Unlearning these patterns can be incredibly difficult, especially if the individual's environment continues to reinforce violent behavior. * Why would they know it is a mistake?   Argument 2   * What does a victim want? Why is it always money? Analyse what the priorities and incentives of a victim are, such that they would make the decisions you claim.   We need to ask POIs consistently!  05:19 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Luke Sun |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house believes that rehabilitation should be the only consideration in criminal sentencing. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  [NOTE: Today’s speeches are 5 minutes’ long.]  Don’t start your speech with a judge! Get to the point as to what the correct definition is, rather than skirting around it.  We need to establish the kinds of prisons we would support; for instance, where they are still part of society, where we focus on upskilling and vocational training etc.  On characterising life in a prison - explain how this is what structurally leads to recidivism.   * Prison life is characterized by deprivation of basic human needs, including freedom, privacy, autonomy, and meaningful social interaction. * Prisons often function as breeding grounds for criminal activity, exposing inmates to negative influences and reinforcing criminal behavior. Individuals may learn new criminal skills, make connections with other criminals, and become further entrenched in a criminal lifestyle.   Our signposting is too lengthy - get to the point re names of clashes!  On education;   * Crime often stems from complex social and psychological factors such as poverty, addiction, lack of education, and trauma. Rehabilitation can address these issues directly, offering therapy, job training, educational opportunities, and substance abuse treatment. We need to analyse why crime happens and how we fix this more comprehensively. * We need to establish, beyond that rehabilitation works, that the primary goal of the justice system should be to reduce crime and improve society. Then, explain how rehabilitation offers the best chance of achieving this by addressing the root causes of criminal behavior and equipping individuals with the skills and support they need to become productive members of society.   On victims - we are impacting compensation and restoration of belief; we aren’t proving it works!  POI - we refuse to make the trade off - we jump to the extreme case of murder/intense crime; what about the abundance of theft that exists?  What is the structure of this speech? Where did we mark our transitions?  We need to ask POIs consistently!  05:17 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Shawn Nip |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house believes that rehabilitation should be the only consideration in criminal sentencing. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  [NOTE: Today’s speeches are 5 minutes’ long.]  Which burden? Our opening needs to be clear and concise. Make the opening less an explanation of what your job does, and focus on doing your job instead. No quick maths weighing please! Justify it properly.  On the type of prisons - explain you don't have to defend horrific prison conditions or systems; rehabilitation is sufficiently bad if they lack the same amount of resources on their side.  Establish how other factors, such as retribution, deterrence, and public safety, must also play a role in sentencing. Ignoring these factors undermines the legitimacy of the legal system and risks jeopardizing public safety.  Clash 1 - started at 2:18   * On hatred - are we sure it doesn’t matter? Or is it the case that a criminal might be too violent to change? This is important, and we need to break this down in greater detail! For instance, ​​for some, violence has become a deeply ingrained pattern of behavior, learned through repeated exposure and reinforcement. Unlearning these patterns can be incredibly difficult, especially if the individual's environment continues to reinforce violent behavior.   Clash 2   * Started at 3:21 * Closure of victims is well identified; explain why this is only achieved in a context where a unique and context dependent sentencing occurs.   + Victims need to feel that the justice system recognizes the severity of the harm they have suffered.   + Victims are not a monolithic group, and their needs and circumstances vary widely. Some victims may prioritize rehabilitation for the offender, while others may prioritize punishment. A context-dependent approach allows for flexibility in sentencing, recognizing that there is no single path to healing and that different victims may require different responses from the justice system.   At the end of every clash, stop and explain what you have achieved and what it means for the debate.  We need to ask POIs consistently!  05:14 | | | | | | |